



August 31, 2006

By facsimile transmission (202) 606-~~5050~~<sup>5417</sup> and first class mail

Ray H. Darling, Executive Secretary  
Occupational Safety and Health Review Commission  
One Lafayette Centre  
1120 20<sup>th</sup> St., N.W.  
Suite 980  
Washington, D.C. 20036-3419

Re: *Summit Contractors Inc.*, No. 05-0839

Dear Mr. Darling:

Enclosed please find for filing an original and eight copies of the Secretary's reply brief in the above-captioned case.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Gary K. Stearman", with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Gary K. Stearman  
Attorney  
U.S. Department of Labor  
Frances Perkins Bldg., Room S-4004  
200 Constitution Ave. N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20210-0001  
(202) 693-5770  
(202) 693-5466 (fax)  
Stearman.gary@dol.gov

Enclosures

cc: Robert E. Rader, Jr., Esq. (enc. by facsimile and mail)

SEP 25 - 11 11:08  
EXECUTIVE RECEIVED  
OFFICE 2L



**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES** ..... ii

**INTRODUCTION**..... 1

**ARGUMENT**

I. *Nationwide Mutual Insurance v. Darden* has no impact on the multi-employer worksite doctrine and Commission precedent arising under the doctrine ..... 3

II. The multi-employer worksite doctrine applies to violations of 29 C.F.R. § 1926.404(b)..... 7

III. Summit incorrectly blames the rental company for creating the hazard ..... 8

IV. Summit had constructive knowledge of the violative condition because it failed to act with reasonable diligence..... 11

**CONCLUSION** ..... 15

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

<b>CASES:</b>	<b><u>pages</u></b>
<i>Access Equipment Systems, Inc.</i> , 18 BNA OSHC 1718 (1999).....	4
<i>AAA Delivery Services, Inc.</i> , 21 BNA OSHC 1219 (No. 02-0923, 2005).....	5
<i>Allstate Painting and Contracting Co., Inc.</i> , 21 BNA OSHC 1033 (Nos. 97-1631& 97-1727, 2005).....	5
* <i>Blount International Ltd.</i> , 15 BNA OSHC 1897 (No. 89-1394 1992).....	7, 8, 11, 13
* <i>Brennan v. OSHRC</i> , 513 F.2d 1032 (2d Cir. 1975).....	3, 4
<i>Centex-Rooney Constr. Co.</i> , 16 BNA OSHC 2127 (No. 92-0851, 1994).....	13
<i>Clarkson v. OSHRC</i> , 531 F.2d 451 (10th Cir. 1976) .....	6
<i>David Weekly Homes</i> , 19 BNA OSHC 1116 (No. 96-0898, 2000).....	13
<i>Dolan v. USPS</i> , 126 S.Ct. 1252 (2006).....	5
<i>Don Davis, d/b/a Davis Ditching and Davis Ditching, Inc.</i> , 19 BNA OSHC 1477 (No. 96-1378, 2001).....	5
<i>Dover Elevator Co.</i> , 16 BNA OSHC 1281 (No. 91- 862, 1993).....	11
<i>Johnson v. City of Saline</i> , 151 F.3d 564 (6th Cir. 1998) .....	3
<i>Frank Swidzinski Co.</i> , 9 BNA OSHC 1230 (No. 76-4627, 1981).....	11

*\*Cases chiefly relied upon are marked with an asterisk*

<i>N &amp; N Contractors, Inc.</i> , 18 BNA OSHC 2121 (No. 96-0606, 2000).....	11
<i>*Nationwide Mutual Insurance v. Darden</i> , 503 U.S. 318 (1992).....	1, <i>passim</i>
<i>Precision Concrete Constr.</i> , 19 BNA OSHC 1404 (No. 99-707, 2001).....	11
<i>Pride Oil Well Serv.</i> , 15 BNA OSHC 1809 (No. 87-692, 1992).....	11, 14
<i>R.P. Carbone Constr. Co. v. OSHRC</i> , 166 F.3d 815 (6th Cir. 1998) .....	8
<i>Sasser Electric &amp; Manufacturing Co.</i> , 11 BNA OSHC 2133 (No. 82-178, 1984).....	8, 10
<i>Stahl Roofing, Inc.</i> , 19 BNA OSHC 2179 (Nos. 00-1268 and 00-1637, 2003).....	11
<i>Timothy Victory</i> , 18 BNA OSHC 1023 (No. 93-3359, 1997).....	5
<i>*United States v. Pitt-Des Moines, Inc.</i> , 168 F.3d 976 (7th Cir. 1999) .....	4
<i>United States v. Silk</i> , 331 U.S. 704 (7th Cir. 1947).....	4, 6
<i>United States v. Wells</i> , 519 U.S. 482 (1997).....	3
<i>Universal Constr. Co. v. OSHRC</i> , 182 F.3d 726 (10th Cir. 1999) .....	4, 5, 6, 7
<i>Variety Corporation v. Howe</i> , 516 U.S. 489 (1996).....	3
<i>Vergona Crane Co.</i> , 15 BNA OSHC 1782 (No. 88-01745, 1992).....	6
<i>Yates v. Hendon</i> , 124 S.Ct 1330 (2004).....	5

**STATUTES AND REGULATIONS:**

2(b), 29 U.S.C. § 651(b) .....	4
3(5), 29 U.S.C. § 652(5) .....	6
5(a)(2), 29 U.S.C. § 652(a)(2).....	4
29 C.F.R. § 1926.404 .....	2
29 C.F.R. § 1926.404(b) .....	7
29 C.F.R. § 1926.404(b)(1).....	7, 13